



## Minutes of 25<sup>TH</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting 06 December 2021 Baku, Azerbaijan

### List of Attached Documents

Sr. No	Document Title	Annexure
1.	List of Participants	I
2.	Welcome speech	II
3.	Opening speech	III
4.	Adoption of the agenda for 25 <sup>th</sup> ECOSAI GBM	IV
5.	Activity report by the Secretary General ECOSAI	V
6.	Presentation of the ECOSAI Annual Accounts	VI
7.	Report of the 20 <sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Training Committee	VII

The 25<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting was held in Azerbaijan in the city of Baku on 06 December 2021. Four Governing Board Members along with their respective delegations participated in the meeting. The following Heads of SAIs and Representatives attended GBM:

Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman, Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Gondal, Secretary General of ECOSAI/ Auditor General of Pakistan.



Mr. Nurlan Nurzhanov, Member of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget of Republic of Kazakhstan.

Mr. Yucel Turhan, Vice President of the Turkish Court of Accounts, Turkey.

List of participants is placed at Annexure-I.

**Agenda Item No.1**

**Welcome Note by Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, the Chairman of the Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan.**

Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman of Chamber of Accounts of Republic of Azerbaijan welcomed the delegates and thanked them for their participation. The welcome speech is placed at Annexure-II.

**Agenda Item No.2**

**Opening Speech by Mr. Nurlan Nurzhanov, Member of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget Republic of Kazakhstan**

Mr. Nurlan Nurzhanov, Member of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget Republic of Kazakhstan on behalf of President of ECOSAI delivered opening speech and initiated proceedings of 25<sup>th</sup> GBM.

He expressed his gratitude to the Chairman of the Chamber of Accounts of Republic of Azerbaijan and welcomed colleagues from the Supreme Audit Institutions of the Republic of Turkey and the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. The opening speech is placed at Annexure-III.

In the end, he invited all Governing Board Members to attend the ECOSAI Assembly, which will be held in August 2022 in Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan.



### **Agenda Item No.3**

#### **Adoption of the Agenda for 24th ECOSAI GBM, Baku, Azerbaijan**

The meeting unanimously adopted the proposed agenda of the 25<sup>th</sup> Governing Board Meeting Annexure-IV.

### **Agenda Item No.4**

#### **Activity Report by the Secretary General of ECOSAI**

The Secretary General ECOSAI presented the Activity Report for the year 2019-20 & 2020-21 for 25<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting December 2021.

- i. The Auditor General of Pakistan mentioned that many activities approved during 24<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI Governing Board Meeting but could not organize according to schedule due to COVID-19.
- ii. The Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan organized ECOSAI E-Seminar on "Audit of Sustainable Development Goals" on June 9, 2020. This first E-Seminar encouraged member SAIs to move from face to face training to online training.
- iii. After successful hosting of this seminar by the SAI Kazakhstan, the SAI Pakistan also hosted two days online training course on "Risk Based Auditing" from 27 January 2021.
- iv. The Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan organized ECOSAI Seminar on "Audit of Public Debt" on 25<sup>th</sup> November, 2021 through video-meeting.
- v. The ECOSAI Secretariat prepared and designed four issues of ECOSAI Circular since the last ECOSAI Governing Board meeting was held, digital copies of the circular were disseminated among the member SAIs.

48



- vi. Articles on different topics including impact of COVID-19, SDGs, quality framework, forensic audit and disruptive technologies were covered in these Circulars.
- vii. In the end he expressed his best wishes to all the ECOSAI members and hoped that ECOSAI members would continue with their efforts to improve public sector auditing.

The activity report of the Secretary General is placed at Annexure-V.

#### **Agenda Item No.5**

##### **Presentation of ECOSAI Annual Accounts**

Mr. Owais Ahmed, Deputy Director, Office of Auditor General of Pakistan presented the Annual Accounts of ECOSAI for the year ended 31 December 2019 and 31 December 2020. He explained in details the following:

- i. Balance sheet of ECOSAI FY 2019.
- ii. Statement of Income and statement 2019.
- iii. Cash flow statement 2019.
- iv. Notes to Accounts-2019.
- v. Balance sheet of ECOSAI FY 2020.
- vi. Statement of Income and statement 2020.
- vii. Cash flow statement 2020.
- viii. Notes to Accounts-2020.
- ix. Accumulated Receipts and Payments.

Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman, Chamber of Accounts, Azerbaijan, inquired about the impact of COVID 19 situation on annual subscriptions of ECOSAI members. It was

41





briefed that 4,920 USD were deposited in FY 2020 in annual contributions by ECOSAI members as compared to USD 9322.88 USD in FY 2019. It is evident that COVID 19 situation had an impact on cash inflows. However, the inflows are expected to gain their usual momentum in the closing months of FY 2021 and would match the inflows of FY 2019. The Chairman, Chamber of Accounts, Azerbaijan inquired about the provisions of expenses from the ECOSAI funds. He was briefed that the funds are specially provisioned for harnessing mutual cooperation and enhancing capacity of ECOSAI members. Moreover, funds can also now be utilized on the training expenses of members of ECOSAI on request. Currently all the training activities were conducted online. In future, the funds would be utilized against face to face meetings too. The Accounts of ECOSAI are placed at Annexure-VI.

#### **Outcome**

GB unanimously adopted the two-year annuals accounts for the year ended 31 December 2019 and 31 December 2020.

#### **Agenda Item No.6**

#### **Report of the 20<sup>th</sup>ECOSAI Training Committee Meeting**

Mr. Owais Ahmed, Deputy Director, Auditor-General office of Pakistan, presented the outcome of 20<sup>th</sup>TCM in 25<sup>th</sup>GBM. Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman, Azerbaijan Chamber of Accounts inquired about the future strategy of ECOSAI in context of online training courses. He was briefed that ECOSAI has modified its approach and adopted online trainings as a mean to continue with interaction among ECOSAI members. He was briefed that the members of 20<sup>th</sup>TCM have realized to change the approach and design of training courses. The courses would be launched on Online Learning hubs as self-paced Massive Open Online Sessions (MOOS). The Secretary General ECOSAI,

4/



Auditor General of Pakistan would present the feasibility of online learning hub, innovation hub and special audit unit as per the decision of 20<sup>th</sup>TCM. The development of online learning hub would be the way forward since the MOOC would be available for ECOSAI members in their official languages. SAI Kazakhstan has resolved to offer three courses for the instant purpose.

Mr. Yucel Turhan, Vice President of Turkey Court of Accounts, praised the efforts of 20<sup>th</sup> TCM and explained that ECOSAI needs to change its methodology. The ECOSAI forum needs to present a new approach and attract the imagination of dormant members. He mentioned that there is a dire need to make the ECOSAI website more interactive. The ECOSAI Website needs to keep track of the visitors and present the news-feed.

The Secretary General ECOSAI, Auditor General of Pakistan, Mr Ajmal Gondal reiterated the resolve and commitment of SAI Pakistan to make the forum more cooperative and significant in the light of recommendations of 20<sup>th</sup>TCM. The 20<sup>th</sup> TCM report is placed at Annexure-VII.

#### **Outcome**

GB unanimously adopted the 20<sup>th</sup>TCM report.

#### **Agenda Item No.7**

##### **Report on Publication of ECOSAI Circulars.**

Mr. Owais Ahmed, Deputy Director SAI Pakistan, presented the Report on the publication of the ECOSAI Circular by the SAI Pakistan. He explained that the ECOSAI Circular is the official organ of ECOSAI and has the objective of providing member SAIs with the forum for sharing experiences in different areas of public sector auditing. It was approved in the 20<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI GBM that the ECOSAI circular will be published twice a



year. The ECOSAI Secretariat prepared and designed four issues of ECOSAI Circular since the last ECOSAI Governing Board meeting was held, digital copies of the circular were disseminated among the member SAIs.

#### **Outcome**

GB unanimously approved the report on the publications of ECOSAI circulars.

#### **Agenda Item No.8**

##### **Report on ECOSAI Trainings 2019-2020 and 2020-2021**

Mr. Owais Ahmed, Deputy Director, presented the Report on ECOSAI Trainings held in 2019-2020 and 2020-2021.

- i. Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan organized ECOSAI E-Seminar on “Audit of Sustainable Development Goals” as a video-meeting on June 9, 2020.
- ii. The SAI Pakistan hosted online training course on “Risk Based Auditing” on 27 January 2021.
- iii. The Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget for the Republic of Kazakhstan organized ECOSAI Seminar on “Audit of Public Debt” on 25<sup>th</sup> November, 2021 (video-meeting).

#### **Outcome**

Governing Board approved the report on ECOSAI trainings held in 2019-2020 and 2020-2021

48





## **Agenda Item No.9**

### **Report on MoUs Signed Between ECOSAI Members**

Mr. Owais Ahmed, Deputy Director, SAI Pakistan presented the report on MoUs signed between ECOSAI members.

- i. Mr. Owais Ahmed briefed that in pursuance of the 14<sup>th</sup> training committee meeting of 2014 recommendations, SAI Pakistan has signed MoUs with SAIs of Iran (2016), Turkey (2016) and Tajikistan (2018). SAI Iran has similar MoUs with SAIs of Turkey and Tajikistan. SAI Kazakhstan has signed MoU with SAI of Iran.
- ii. The SAI Pakistan's three-member trainer's team visited Ankara May 07-12, 2018 for delivery of Peer Review training and two members SAI Turkey's delegation visited SAI Pakistan for signing of concept agreement signing as the second phase from August 14-18, 2018. SAI Pakistan's three-member trainer's team visited Ankara December 02-15, 2018 for conducting the Peer Review of TCA and its field work. Peer review report was approved and presented to President TCA electronically on September 16, 2020, which was later on acknowledged by President TCA on September 22, 2020.
- iii. Mr. Owais Ahmed briefed that the SAI Tajikistan has informed that MoU between SAIs Turkey and Tajikistan is almost finalized and just signing-process is awaited.
- iv. It is also informed that signing of MoUs between SAIs of Azerbaijan, Turkey and Pakistan is under process.





#### **Agenda Item No.10**

##### **Other matters**

Chamber of Accounts of Republic of Azerbaijan had shown its intention for Presidentship of ECOSAI for year 2023-2025. However, the issue was not pressed during the 25<sup>th</sup>GBM meeting.

It will be decided in the next Assembly of ECOSAI.

#### **Agenda Item No.11**

##### **Closing Address**

Mr. Nurlan Nurzhanov, Member of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget, Republic of Kazakhstan expressed his gratitude to all the participants and the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan for the organization of 25<sup>th</sup>GBM.



**Signed:**

Mr. Vugar Gulmammadov, Chairman, Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Mr. Muhammad Ajmal Gondal, Secretary General of ECOSAI/Auditor General of Pakistan.

Mr. Nurlan Nurzhanov, Member of the Accounts Committee for Control over Execution of the Republican Budget of Republic of Kazakhstan/ President of ECOSAI.

Mr. Yucel Turhan, Vice President of the Turkish Court of Accounts.